

Message

---

**From:** Bahadori, Tina [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=7DA7967DCAFB4C5BBC39C666FEE31EC3-BAHADORI, TINA]  
**Sent:** 9/6/2018 10:10:55 AM  
**To:** Dutton, Steven [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=795a1526feec425f8be0b3f5c0a671c6-Dutton, Steve]; Ross, Mary [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=98359cd1f66f46ec91d327e99a3c6909-Ross, Mary]; Greaver, Tara [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=87aaee6c3784c4ba57193cdb5ba84f4-Greaver, Tara]; Lassiter, Meredith [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=7ded5434987049279312097f28ec4dfc-Lassiter, Meredith]; Herrick, Jeffrey [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=d8680b3bda0140bfa523e1d8466f5da0-Herrick, Jeffrey]; Felker-Quinn, Emmi [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=41264ccf274d4b89b9089214b56731fb-Felker-Quin]; Vandenberg, John [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=dcae2b98a04540fb8d099f9d4dead690-Vandenberg, John]; McDow, Stephen [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=7fa2d5f84bf740beb15ecd12c83bda45-McDow, Stephen]  
**CC:** Avery, James [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=b0fc9e70467647709fa9377dfb987f10-Avery, James]; Bussard, David [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=cf26b876393e44f38bdd06db02dbbfe5-Bussard, David]; Gatchett, Annette [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=f12d699a71f84e21bddbb876dae7f96c-Gatchett, Annette]; Hagerthey, Scot [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=40321ee06f2848b89f820d4a230cfde7-Hagerthey, Scot]; Saint, Chris [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=b85c2ad71ca8454f86716fd3eb8fc888-Saint, Christopher]; Thayer, Kris [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=3ce4ae3f107749c6815f243260df98c3-Thayer, Kri]; Thompson, Stephen [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=e956e9d4205945e99506851a314a99d3-Thompson, Stephen]; Troyer, Michael [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=847b0020dd0e457e85f994a1ad64b26d-Troyer, Michael]; Lavoie, Emma [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=86ac7844f12646c095e4e9093a941623-Lavoie, Emma]; Jones, Samantha [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=eac77fe3b20c4667b8c534c90c15a830-Jones, Samantha]; Kraft, Andrew [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=4a94a4f199b247778abb02285a51b927-Kraft, Andrew]; Champlin, Anna [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=f59084b342934f42aba4643b326f8611-Osaka, Anna]  
**Subject:** RE: WOW!! NOx SOx PM ISA team!! WOW!!

YES! I listened to it most of the day yesterday and was blown away by the constant flow of accolades! Congratulations, team!!!! The science for this assessment was exceptionally multiplexed; the treatment of it in this ISA was elegant and impactful. That much was evident in the many briefings you had to do up and down the chain. In addition though, the structure of the document, the integrated synthesis, the tables/figures were each models in translational science and knowledge delivery. I am copying Andrew Kraft – a ‘visual nerd’ like him will appreciate the art in this document. I will encourage him to delve in and help us import some of the innovations into our other assessment products.

The one complaint I had was about SABSO. I could not believe that even when they run an adobe link (which worked really well yesterday), they still do not project the slides in adobe; so adobe was just a sound link not a webcast. They need training in technology, honestly!!! But that's for another day.

So, again CONGRATULATIONS ISA team. Thank you for energizing and invigorating us – just when we were becoming completely depleted!!!! You have put the fight right back in our systems!!!

Tina

---

**From:** Dutton, Steven

**Sent:** Wednesday, September 5, 2018 10:13 PM

**To:** Ross, Mary <Ross.Mary@epa.gov>; Greaver, Tara <Greaver.Tara@epa.gov>; Lassiter, Meredith <lassiter.meredith@epa.gov>; Herrick, Jeffrey <Herrick.Jeffrey@epa.gov>; Felker-Quinn, Emmi <felker-quinn.emmi@epa.gov>; Vandenberg, John <Vandenberg.John@epa.gov>; McDow, Stephen <McDow.Stephen@epa.gov>

**Cc:** Avery, James <Avery.James@epa.gov>; Bahadori, Tina <Bahadori.Tina@epa.gov>; Bussard, David <Bussard.David@epa.gov>; Gatchett, Annette <Gatchett.Annette@epa.gov>; Hagerthey, Scot <Hagerthey.Scot@epa.gov>; Saint, Chris <Saint.Chris@epa.gov>; Thayer, Kris <thayer.kris@epa.gov>; Thompson, Stephen <Thompson.Stephen@epa.gov>; Troyer, Michael <Troyer.Michael@epa.gov>; Vandenberg, John <Vandenberg.John@epa.gov>

**Subject:** RE: WOW!! NOx SOx PM ISA team!! WOW!!

I second Mary's kudos! Fantastic job all. It was really nice to sit back and listen to all the positive and constructive comments from CASAC on this exceptionally well executed document. Here are just a few of the positive comments I heard today:

Richard Poirot – been doing this for 10 years and this is the “best job I’ve ever seen in a NAAQS review. I hope this is used as a guide for how these are developed in the future. Really works well.”, “graphics and tabular summaries are excellent”

Donna Kenski – the executive summary and integrative synthesis were a “model of brevity”

Frank Gilliam – in commenting on the wetlands ecosystem N enrichment material: “exceptionally well written chapter, an ‘accept with minor revisions’ type of chapter” (Doug Burns and Hans Pearl had similar positive comments on this chapter)

Doug Burns – in commenting on the freshwater and wetlands material: “really nice section”, would make a really good review paper

Lauraine Chestnut – use of causal organization in integrative summary was good

Donna Kenski – “figures showing causal conclusions are very nicely done”

Praveen Amar – “final paragraph in the executive summary is beautifully written, I was impressed”

Steven Dutton  
Deputy Division Director  
U.S. EPA/ORD/NCEA-RTP  
[dutton.steven@epa.gov](mailto:dutton.steven@epa.gov)  
919-541-5035 office

---

**From:** Ross, Mary  
**Sent:** Wednesday, September 05, 2018 9:30 PM  
**To:** Greaver, Tara <Greaver.Tara@epa.gov>; Lassiter, Meredith <lassiter.meredith@epa.gov>; Herrick, Jeffrey <Herrick.Jeffrey@epa.gov>; Felker-Quinn, Emmi <felker-quinn.emmi@epa.gov>; Vandenberg, John <Vandenberg.John@epa.gov>; Dutton, Steven <Dutton.Steven@epa.gov>; McDow, Stephen <McDow.Stephen@epa.gov>  
**Cc:** Avery, James <Avery.James@epa.gov>; Bahadori, Tina <Bahadori.Tina@epa.gov>; Bussard, David <Bussard.David@epa.gov>; Dutton, Steven <Dutton.Steven@epa.gov>; Gatchett, Annette <Gatchett.Annette@epa.gov>; Hagerthey, Scot <Hagerthey.Scot@epa.gov>; Saint, Chris <Saint.Chris@epa.gov>; Thayer, Kris <thayer.kris@epa.gov>; Thompson, Stephen <Thompson.Stephen@epa.gov>; Troyer, Michael <Troyer.Michael@epa.gov>; Vandenberg, John <Vandenberg.John@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** WOW!! NOx SOx PM ISA team!! WOW!!

What a fantastic CASAC meeting today - Congratulations to the NOx SOx PM ISA team\*!!

The CASAC review of the second draft ISA for ecological effects of NOx, SOx and PM was filled with accolades from one chapter to the next. Steve Dutton can correct me on this, as he was taking notes, but I believe it was Rich Poirot, a veteran of many CASAC panels and former CASAC member, who said that this was the BEST ISA he had ever reviewed. He hoped that it would be a model for future assessments. Excellent job, ISA Team, I hope that you're enjoying a night of celebration and relaxation. Thank you!!

\*I am sure that I've missed people on the team - please forward!!